



**The Library**  
UC SAN DIEGO

## **The Burden of History**

a Round Table Discussion

May 03, 2017

1 hour, 15 minutes, 40 seconds

Speakers: Tal Golan, Judi Gottschalk and Gershon Shafir

Transcribed by: Rachel E Lieu

[Holocaust Living History Workshop](#)

UC San Diego Library Digital Collections

<https://library.ucsd.edu/dc/object/bb5054052b>

Copyright: Under copyright (US)

Rights Holder: UC Regents

Use: This work is available from the UC San Diego Library. This digital copy of the work is intended to support research, teaching, and private study.

Constraint(s) on Use: This work is protected by the U.S. Copyright Law (Title 17, U.S.C.). Use of this work beyond that allowed by "fair use" requires written permission of the UC Regents. Responsibility for obtaining permissions and any use and distribution of this work rests exclusively with the user and not the UC San Diego Library. Inquiries can be made to the UC San Diego Library program having custody of the work.

The Burden of History - a Round Table Discussion (2017)  
Holocaust Living History Workshop

Time      Transcription

00:00      [The Library / UC San Diego]

00:06      [A Holocaust Living History Workshop Event]

00:12      [May 3, 2017 / A Burden of History - a Round Table Discussion - with Tal Golan, Judi Gottschalk, Gershon Shafir]

00:13      Susanne Hillman: It is a pleasure to welcome you all tonight to this Holocaust Living History Workshop. I'm Susanne Hillman the Program Coordinator. This program, as some of you know, is an education and outreach program sponsored by the UC San Diego Library and the Jewish Studies Program. The title of tonight's event is *The Burden of History* which coincidentally is also the theme of this year's entire lecture series. Our opening event of the year featured a Bulgarian Holocaust survivor and today we are pleased to host several second, so-called, second-generation survivors. What unites all of them, I think, is the weight of a violent history. How does one live in the aftermath of a calamity like the Shoah? How do the children of the survivors deal with the trauma transmitted to them by their parents? Today's event will address the second of these questions. Before I will introduce our moderator, I would like to, um, announce an event that is taking place tomorrow in the Seuss Room and I, that I strongly recommend to anybody who's interested in these kinds of questions and the history of Germany. Tomorrow Michael Geyer an internationally renowned historian, Professor Emeritus of German and European History at the University of Chicago is going to give a talk titled *What It Means to be German, a Family's Journey through 20th Century German History 1910 to 2011*. That is tomorrow, here in the Seuss Room at 3 o'clock. And now it is my pleasure to introduce the moderator of this roundtable discussion, Dr. Joel Dimsdale. Dr. Dimsdale is Distinguished Professor Emeritus in the UC San Diego Department of Psychiatry. He has been a consultant to the President's Commission on Mental Health, The Institute of Medicine, The National Academy of Sciences, and The National Institutes of Health. He has written more than a staggering 500 scientific papers and is the author of *Anatomy of Malice: The Enigma of the Nazi War Criminals*, published by Yale University Press in 2016 and today is an auspicious day because, just today, the paperback version came out of this book. Please join me in welcoming Dr. Joel Dimsdale.

02:46      Dr. Joel Dimsdale: Thank you Susanne, and uh, I'm delighted that you all are here with us this evening. This is an auspicious point of departure for, uh, the series. Many of our presentations have focused on moving, terribly important testimony by survivors or survivors' families about what transpired in their encounters with genocide. Today's focus is a little different. What are the reverberations of this exposure down to the next generation? We're fortunate to have a distinguished panel of diverse background and I asked the, our panelists - whom I will introduce in a moment - I asked our panelists to consider the following sorts of questions.

How old were you when you became aware of your parent's involvement in the Holocaust? How was that information conveyed to you? What were your reactions at the time - as children - and how did it shape your view of the world - as children? And then I asked the same set of questions about - as adults. How has this family legacy shaped your life and your view of the world? And then finally, I asked the question - as parents, how has that rippled down? How, how has this information been transmitted and received by your children indeed? So, we have a wonderful panel. I've asked each panelist to speak for 10 or 15 minutes in the hopes that we will have an interchange among the panel, and with the rest of you. We all have a life experience that shapes us and memories that shape us. I think this should be extraordinarily interesting. I'll introduce each speaker, and the first speaker this evening is Judy Gottschalk. Judy is the Regional Chair for Wings of Memory, of The United States Holocaust Memorial Museum. Judy retired as principal of an elementary school in Phoenix after 40 years as an educator. She earned her undergraduate degree in Education and Social Sciences here in San Diego, at SDSU [San Diego State University], and a Master's in Educational Leadership at Northern Arizona University. Today she develops curricula for anti-bullying and Holocaust education. Judy.

06:05 Judy Gottschalk: I got a lot of stuff here. Okay, first of all, thank you Dr. Hillman for inviting me to be part of the panel and I want to start by thanking my parents, who are survivors of course of Auschwitz, uh, for not only the burden of history but for the gift of history in many ways. So kind of reframing that just a little bit, uh for, for me tonight. So I wanted to start by reading a quote. I know I only have a few minutes, but I thought this was so good, and this is actually from a book called *Inherited Memories: [Israeli Children of Holocaust Survivors]*. I'm not an Israeli child of Holocaust survivors, as my colleagues are over here, but there was an excellent quote that I wanted to share. This is about early childhood, family, and school. A man named Udi Sivosh wrote this, "Children accept the life they are born into. They do not begin to question and compare until later in life. Is this how other people, most people, live? Is this the norm? And is, it is only much later that they can start examining the effects of the findings they have seen. As a child, one accepts the structure of the family as the norm. It is the survivors, the parents, whose lives - unlike their children's - were shaped before the Holocaust. Who can have any idea of a difference? It is they who feel the loss. Unlike their children, they know what it is to have had a family and many children have spoken of a late realization of family life, of a community, which they could never be taken for granted."

07:45 Judy Gottschalk: So, as a child, how did I see it then is very different than how I see it now. My parents never spoke of the Holocaust. My parents came to, actually to San Diego in 1949. Can you imagine that, straight from the darkest, deepest bowels of Europe to sunny, palm trees, ocean, going barefoot, a new life? But my parents never spoke of the Holocaust. My father never spoke of it. I never heard

my father speak of it. Maybe the week he died. My mother never spoke of it. So actually the question of how I find out found out is really a mystery to me. I really don't know how I knew that there. But I've read that this is somewhat common, uh, that there's just some kind of covert osmosis that, that happens. I don't know how else to say it. Um, there were many covert messages. One of, you know, remember clogs? Anybody remember clogs? Could not have clogs, no wooden shoes. Why? You just can't, no wooden shoes. Okay, but clogs are in. Doesn't matter. You know, go shopping for pajamas - no striped pajamas - nothing yellow for some reason - no yellow - no yellow roses - no yellow nothing. I don't really still know why, but so. Lot of eat your food. Boy, what I would have given for that food. Eat your dinner. You know, you're lucky you have it. Um I, we didn't go as far as the starving children in India, but you knew there was some message there. Um, I wasn't ever sure what it was. Um, I never really overheard my parents discussing this with friends, that I can remember, um and I never thought about the fact - never thought about the fact - that I didn't have relatives, that I didn't have grandparents, aunts, uncles, uh, cousins. I never had thought about it, um, even when I got married and my husband had a big family. I never thought about, where's my family, as a child.

09:59 Judy Gottschalk: I think that in looking back - I'll talk about this just a little bit later - but I probably suffered from some post-traumatic stress that was passed on because I cried a lot. My teachers used to write, you know, Judy's a good student but she cries a lot and I think they were concerned about me. My brother always used to say to me, did you have your daily cry today? He'd like to tease me. Um, so I cried a lot; I probably still cry a lot, but I remember as a child. Um, and my mother had a terrible temper and that affected me. She used to throw things. She'd be mortified if she sees this, but anyway, um she had a terrible temper, and she would throw things, and run out of the house. And she did calm down over the years, but I remember being really afraid, not that she would hurt me, but just you know seeing a parent in pain. I do remember that. Um, I have very little memories though, and I think, um, through a lot of therapy, um, I think I was shut down. And that goes to that trauma, you know, that the hypothalamus, or whatever, shuts down in your brain and it wasn't working for me. Um, so you know that that's a lot of what I can say about my childhood, but in looking back overall it was carefree. I was happy. I had a lot of normal experiences, and I don't know what that is. I'm so sorry. I must have hit a button here. Anyway, okay, don't look at that. Okay, um, but I did have a happy childhood.

11:44 Judy Gottschalk: Uh, then I went to college. I went to UCLA [University of California at Los Angeles] first, before I went to San Diego State and I remember reading a book by Elie Wiesel in college. Can you imagine? And I was clued in, there's something that sparked in me. And it was that he wrote about losing his family. And I remember calling my mother and saying, oh my God. You know, are you, you know, are you so sad? Are you like okay in your life? Like I, am I good

enough for you? Is it, do you think about your family? And, you know, it was a moment. Um, and that was, I guess when I first recognized, you know, what, what was happening. I think I'm maybe a little slow because I'm sure other people would have figured this out sooner. Um, I also then read Dorothy Rabinowitz's book *New Lives: [Survivors of the Holocaust Living in America]*. I don't know how many of you are child survivors in the audience and have read that book, but I remember reading it and thinking, wow. I felt like I was looking in a mirror. These people were just like me. They were very codependent for their parents. I was very codependent, um, still am - worrying about my parents all the time, and worried they were worrying about me. There's a lot of worrying going on. Um, I know when I was a teenager I never would do anything that would, um, worry my parents, like even go to the drive-in movie. You know, my mother said, can't go to the drive-in movie. People get murdered at the drive-in movie. So, of course, I never did that. And I was always, I remember one time I was in college, let's go to Mexico. You know, and I was like, I can't go to Mexico without telling my parents. What if something happened to me and they didn't know it? And, oh they would be so upset. And I can't worry them like, you know, they're, they've already been too traumatized in your life. So, you see the pattern here of giving up my own identity and a lot of my own life, uh, because of them and for them.

13:50 Judy Gottschalk: Um, so that that was, that's an interesting uh thing that happened and I, I know I said this in Dr. Hillman's class a few weeks ago, but I never felt that I could have my own pain as an adult - especially as an adult - you know, that I, who could compare your pain to somebody who've been in Auschwitz, for God's sake? You know, you know, you can work harder. You can be better. You, you know, you should not complain about anything because who would have - even when I was in labor I said, oh you you're just a weenie. You know, your dad was in Auschwitz for three weeks for God's sake. All this is having a baby, everybody does this. So, you know, a lot of that, and it took me till I was about 30-35 to realize, you know, I get to own my own pain. I get to, I get to be okay with that. But I still work on that a lot. Um, as an adult I visited my mother's birthplace and, at the kind of parallel, she went back to Auschwitz. And she was able to put to rest where her parents had died. And she, you know, it's kind of her own shiva, I guess. And at that time she began to speak, and take it on, um, and become active in the New Life Club. And that sort of then, as I was able to hear her speak, and to hear her story, then, you know, then I became more aware of, of the Holocaust, what happened to my parents, etc.

15:26 Judy Gottschalk: Um, as an adult, being a child of survivors has shaped my, my love of Judaism. I'm Jewish because of that. I'm not Jewish because I had a formal Jewish education. I did have a bat mitzvah but it is because of what happened to our people that we have to keep this alive. Never again - this is what drives me in so many ways. This is what has shaped me in, in my love of being Jewish, my values, resilience. I learned that from my parents. But interestingly enough, my

mother would always, you know, say, ahh, such a beautiful day. Wake up, look how beautiful it is today. We're so lucky to be alive. And then she had a stroke which, you know about five years ago, and she became the most negative person. And I, I keep saying to her, but remember when you kept telling me, you know, to be sunny, and happy, and overcome, you know, have a good attitude. But now in her, maybe her post-traumatic stress has now come out, that she had smashed down all those years. And, you know, this is, you know, her later life. And I don't know what happens up in the brain, but something. So, she's changed, uh, too. But I still am very clear about my sense of resilience, and what's important, and choosing your attitude. And I brought my favorite book, *Man's Search for Meaning*, Victor Frankl, and how we get to choose our destiny, and choose - even if we're in the direst of everything - that we get to choose what we want, and who we are, and our attitude about everything. Um, I don't know. I don't know, talking about my children and how much time I have. It feels like, feels like, oh well. I've been up here a long time.

17:26 Judy Gottschalk: Okay, um, you know, I don't know about my kids. Um, I don't remember ever formally sitting down saying, your, you know, your grandparents were in the Holocaust. Um, I think they learned about Holocaust in school. You know, sort of that passed on - I'm afraid to have the conversation. I'm afraid to scare them, but they learned about it in school and then they sort of naturally started asking questions. I know what, a couple of my kids invited their grandmother to speak in, in junior high, and then they were very comfortable asking my mother questions. Um, I would say that um it's a hard sell, uh, to the fourth - or the third generation. Uh, my kids are, I think Jewish; um, they have a Jewish heart mostly because they went to camp. And I hope, I hope this shapes them. But my middle son said to me a couple months ago, you know, mom I think that we have to stop using the Holocaust as a reason to support Israel. And of course, I was like, what are you talking about? You know, that's like blasphemy. You can't say that. And we had a pretty good, you know, long, I would say, argument/discussion about it. But I think he represents a lot of young people, uh, today. Um, I'm hoping that maybe when I die he'll feel differently, but right now he doesn't. Um, I, I don't feel that I'm any different. There are many, uh, children of survivors and many in this room. Everybody has a different story. I think I'm strong. I think I, you know, my parents have taught me so much about their experiences and, um, what you can do in life when all is taken from you, how you can overcome, have hope, and have redemption. So important.

19:37 Dr. Joel Dimsdale: Thank you, uh, Judy. We now move to another person who did not grow up here in San Diego. Our next speaker is Tal Golan, who's Associate Professor of History here at UCSD and he directs the Law and Society Program. Tal received his Ph.D. in History from Berkeley and is the author or editor of four books, among them *Laws of Men and Laws of Nature: The History of Scientific Expert Testimony [in England and America]*. Tal.

20:30 Tal Golan: Um, hi. Nothing of my expertise related to my talk today except for the dubious titles of being the second generation, um, which I totally feel uncomfortable with. Okay, all right. Um two years ago when um Israeli - how would you say, [unclear] - state controller published his official report of 1916, he mentioned a previous report and a long series of report that dealt with a very painful problem - how you deal with Holocaust survivors. He mentioned, uh, there's less than 150 of them living in Israel right now. Their average age is 85. More than a thousand of them die every month and, uh, there's still a lot of problem in Israel with how the government is supporting them, and what happened to their belongings, and real estate, and a lot of problems still reside with it. He opened - I'm not here to complain on anything - I just thought he opened it with a song, a poem, in Israel. It says:

[One Human Tissue]

When I shall die,  
something of mine will die in you.

When you'll die,  
something of yours will die with you in me.

Because all of us, all of us, yes  
are all one living human tissue  
and if one of us  
goes from us  
something dies in us -  
and something stays with him

If we'll know, how to comfort  
the hostility, if only we'd know.

If we'll know, how to quiet our rage  
(if we'd know how to quiet)  
upon the fury of our humiliation, to say sorry.  
If we'd know how to start from the beginning.

22:33 Tal Golan: Uh that's it. Let's end the if we, that's the wish if we knew how to start from the beginning. Um, where am I going with this? I just, I read that, the report. I thought about the dilemma that Israel stands. How do you, what do you do with such a memory? Society memory in Israel, of the Holocaust, was nationalized. It's very public and the personal stories are strained to find a way into the public. They have to be ritualized in [unclear], put into certain stages in certain formats, and for the longest time, the survivors themselves were kept in the dark as part of what they contribute to the national story. People were ashamed of them. They themselves were ashamed of the story that they had to tell, sometimes even within the families themselves. How does a father tell the son that all his family died in

concentration camp? It's a troubling question and I, I'm not I'm not here to offer any answer. I'll give an example at the end how I ended up telling it to my kids, but my father chose not to tell me. It's not that he didn't tell me stories, but ah, he used to sit by my bedside and tell me what seems to me at the time an endless string of adventure stories. He had a rich life. He had incredible, fantastic adventures: how he survived the war, he was in Ghetto Warsaw, he escaped, he pretended to be a Polack farmer, then he joined the partisans, and then he eventually was a illegal immigrant to Israel. And now where, you know, he married the wife; he had three kids and made a life for himself. He told me a lot of story but none of those stories was tragic and none of it he touched upon the pain and the sorrow that was part of him.

22:46 Tal Golan: Later, when we came - so this was my experience as a kid, all right. [unclear] to learn bravery, [unclear], the ability to think fast, also stories about the kindness of people that helped him along the way. So he kept it to himself. There were two reasons for it, I think. One of them, he thought that this is not a memory that kid should be grown - should be. This is not something they should encounter, they should deal with. And he also extended, he thought that he had a criticism about the larger society and the way that it became the founding ethos in Israel. No more kind of grew up in to be a social anxiety that is strongly shared in Israel and dictates a lot of it's, the way it's perceived with the present and shape the future and its policies and he, he never felt comfortable with this. He thought that this is a bad idea for a society that strives to be normal, to educate their kids with this base, much of the identity of national identity of a trauma. He never forced it on anybody else. He was not kind of argumentative, but that's how he he dealt with it, with his own family. So I learned - so this is the first part, I mean, I, - the second part of the story with me and memories of my father came much later when I was already a young, or not so young professor of history, and he asked me to join him to a trip in Poland. [unclear] in Israel still is of sending youth delegations to the sites in the Holocaust usually with testimony people that can testify to what happened to them.

27:01 Speaker 1: Sorry, I just, would you mind talking into the mic?

27:05 Tal Golan: I'm sorry, okay. So he, he was asked to join one of those delegations. He will, he didn't want to do it alone. He asked me to come and join him. I joined him for what was like two weeks, in which I saw him change completely from a closed person and he didn't like to talk about this, to somebody who just opened up more, and more, and more - talk with the kids about everything. We already got two days in between, and that was maybe the key event that opened him up, that we got for ourselves. And we were able to trace down exactly the farm that he did, and the people that helped him. And then, and so then he came back to Israel, and I went back to the [United] States where I was doing my postdoc. And two years later he sent me a package this size, in handwriting, of his memoirs. And I looked

at it once and I said, let's make a deal. Okay, if you print it, I'll edit it and publish it, because there's no way I could read what was in it. And he did just that and he printed it. All right. So, uh, can I get help with the image? Thanks.

28:44 Tal Golan: Um, so I edited it and was about to publish, and then I asked him, uh - thank you - to, um, we spoke about the cover of the book, and this is the cover of the book, and I'm gonna say a few things about this cover. Okay and actually I'm gonna read what I wrote about this if you don't mind. It would take me about six minutes, seven minutes. [reading from his book] So there were these three kids who grew up together in Warsaw. Their names were Fishal, Berel, and Yuzek. They came together in the summer of [19]38 while playing in the streets of Warsaw. They play soccer. They throw stones at the wall, the, uh, the Jewish version of baseball, you know, games children play. And in the rare times that they were not running around, they loved having Berel tell story about his uncle. He called him the king of the world. His uncle - he immigrated a generation earlier, to the new world, and made it big in golden California in the movies industry. By the following summer of [19]39, these three kids were all about 10 years old, ready to enter third grade. Then, Berel suddenly disappeared. All his family disappeared, and the rumor that spread in the neighborhood were that the rich uncle came for a short visit and took the family with him back to the land of plenty. A couple of months later, in the fall of [19]39, the war started and by the following, uh, fall of 1940 the street in which Fishal and Yuzek lived and played were crowded by approximately 400,000 Jews - ordered by the Germans to move and squeeze in the newly defined Jewish zone, which came to be known as the Jewish Warsaw Ghetto.

30:44 Tal Golan: So school never opened again for Fishal and Yuzek, which left a lot of free time for them to play, and they stuck together and supported each other. And when they met, they frequently talked about their absent friend Berel, who enjoyed imagining how we - and they enjoyed imagining Berel and how he lived in heavenly California. And okay. And they soon began to plan their own escape to this heaven on earth, which they imagined to be just outside the city - they were 10 years old - not too far away, where Berel, their good old friends would await them, and welcome them with open arms. The first step was to build their getaway car. Fishal and Yuzek picked up furnitures they found in one of the growing number of deserted apartments in the Ghetto. They chose a sturdy board a little over a single square yard, tied two iron pipes on the board, and added wheels they took off the children's bikes they found abandoned in the streets. In a week time, they had a small cart with which they planned to escape the Ghetto. They tied the rope to the cart and started practice, practicing every morning. One set in the cart, the other pulled, and when he tired, they switched. And when they found more deserted bikes with better-fitted wheels, they substituted them for the lesser wheels. This way their cart constantly improved, and the distances the two young kids traveled grew accordingly. Who knows, they may have ended up in California if not for the

high wall that they ran into which closed down on the street they were practicing in, and ended their escape plan.

32:32 Tal Golan: So this is what my father drew. This is the cart at the bottom right of the picture, and that's uh that's the wall that he remembered. Now, Fishal never made it to California, in the fall of [19]42 he and his entire family were transported to Treblinka. Yuzek was more lucky. He evaded the large action, escaped the Ghetto in the winter of [19]43, just days before the final uprising, hid in the frozen forest for weeks until a Polish farmer found him half starved and delirious and took him in and trained Yuzek in farm labor and taught him how to pretend and behave like a good Polack. Yuzek learned well and survived the war, moving around having all kinds of crazy adventures. He ended the war, he was the only survivor of a family of eight. Then in [19]46, still a teenager, immigrated illegally to Palestine where, as I said before, he invented himself afresh, suppressed his previous life as a Polish boy. He changed his name from Yuzek Goldberg to Joseph Golan - I'm getting emotional here, one second - and didn't speak about this for about 60 years until he - and in 1997, 60 years after he last, he last saw his friends Berel and Fishal, he finally made it to California. He came to visit me in Berkeley and he stayed for three weeks. We traveled in California; had a wonderful time together. I didn't mention any of it until he gave me the illustration for the cover of the book. And that's how we introduce his story to the kids, and we talked about the picture. He talks about kids, who wants to get to California on a little cart, and they imagine it's just behind the walls. That's how I talk to them about it. And that's it, thank you.

34:53 Dr. Joel Dimsdale: Thank you, Tal. Our third speaker is, uh, Gershon Shafir. Gershon is a professor of Sociology here at UCSD [University of California, San Diego] and the founding Director of the Human Rights Program. Gershon received his Ph.D. in Sociology from Berkeley and is the author or editor of ten books, including one just published by UC [University of California] Press entitled *A Half Century of Occupation: Israel, Palestine, and the World's Most Intractable Conflict*. Gershon.

35:39 Gershon Shafir: Thank you very much. On April 21, 1945, the Jewish Agency's Office of Documentation, that was opened shortly after the liberation of Budapest by the Red Army was humming with activity. At one desk a woman named Franziska was taking down in shorthand the testimony of Joseph - he asked her to call him Yoshka - on what he had went through during his eight and a half months in Auschwitz. Later that day, she would type it up. And to collect and record the survivor's testimonies, was the very purpose of this office, which later on became the kernel for Yad Vashem. Yoshka shared with her that he had already written down his recollections and was, is getting ready to publish them and he was only too happy to share that, share that book with her. They talked about this and that, and that evening Franziska met her good friend Annie and told her that she met the man that she would marry. This is how my parents met. Looking at the way my

parents responded - and I would say not coped, but responded - to the time of peril. He, in Auschwitz - she, passing with false Christian papers in a different district of Budapest than the one that she grew up in. I want to note just how many-sided their responses were, and each of these responses also strengthened the bond they had with each other, and it affected me as well.

37:32 Gershon Shafir: So, the first response was the, a preservation of memory. This indeed consisted of my mother taking down my father's protocol. My father writing his book, *I Was a Captive in Auschwitz* which became the first memoir in Hungarian on survivor's experience, and also much more. Now it is commonly believed these days that survivors remained silent about their experiences. For the longest time, psychologists explained that Holocaust survivors were too traumatized to speak about their experiences. Literary scholars suggest that even had they wanted to talk about what they went through, they didn't have the proper language to do so. There was no vocabulary to describe what they experienced. But my parents were never silent. I knew, and gradually learned, what it is that they went through. It wasn't always easy for me to remember - remember I was a kid - but I would ask them repeatedly to tell me of their experiences. Nor was their circle of friends silent. And if indeed there was such a silence, it didn't exist in the years after the Holocaust. It has come about only later, I believe, as a result of indifference and silencing, or rather as a result of the lack of audience for the longest time. Many survivors that I knew viewed me as a safe person with whom they could share their experiences, even sometimes experiences they had difficulty talking about with others. Now, notwithstanding my own background, it was not easy for me to find my own place or role in the Memory Project, and my first foray, it was in response to a request by Cornelius Salk, who was the former director of the Anne Frank House in Amsterdam.

39:40 Gershon Shafir: Cor, as he liked to be called, knew my father because my father was a friend of Otto Frank. This is a friendship that goes back to them sharing the same barrack in Auschwitz. Otto, Anne's father, and I also met, and I visited Otto and his half a dozen times. And so, in 1991 I came to Chair the Anne Frank Exhibit Committee for San Diego. We brought a traveling exhibit to campus, trained students as docents, had a special course for high school teachers, and several thousand students visited the exhibit that ran for a whole month here at the newly built Price Center. A, a few years later by 1997-1998 I was ready to teach what I think might have been the very first course at UCSD on the Holocaust. I stayed up the whole night before my first class and watched the documentaries about the liberation of the camps that I couldn't bring myself to watch before that, and I can tell you that I barely slept for the 10 weeks during which I took this course. The course, which I titled The Holocaust, was one of the most unusual classes, I thought, because of the diversity of the students in it. One student came up to me after class to tell me that her grandfather had served in the Wehrmacht and on the Russian Front and assured her that the German soldiers were never involved in

the killing of Jews, but she wanted to find out the truth from me. A, a black student wanted to talk about the similarities between the Middle Passage and the sealed train rides to Nazi death camps. Yet another student told me that she was Jewish but until now she hadn't identified as such.

41:33 Gershon Shafir: So, I discovered just how universal the experience of the Holocaust had become and how many different kinds of students viewed it as a moral compass in assessing a whole range of personal and social issues. Unlike the Armenian genocide, which again one Armenian student confided in me had remained a dirty family secret, the Holocaust became universal legacy. And I found out that teaching places a special onus on us. We cannot betray the principles of tolerance, equal respect, and rights, and still, teach the course credibly. The relationship between memory and justice could not be severed. My parent's second response was the search for justice. My father served as state witness in the trial of the Hungarian Gendarme Captain who affected, effectively, kidnapped his labor battalion, that was called up by the Hungarian authorities, and after beating to death one person with his own hands at the train station, handed the group over to the SS to be shipped to Auschwitz. This Captain, Captain Zoldi, who until then denied any guilt, was cross-examined by my father and confessed to that murder. Later on, he was sentenced to death. My father was also interviewed, though not invited as a witness, for the [Adolf] Eichmann trial. I was riveted to that trial. I can still hear the raspy and dramatic voice of Gideon Hausner, the Israeli State Prosecutor, and each day I cut out from the daily press development articles and created my own scrapbook. I ended it up, I ended it with the concluding sentence of my father's own book which said: "Let this book serve as an assurance that humanity acknowledges its errors and will not again by rights laid claimed to by the strong, fling some group as defenseless prey to hatred and cruel instincts."

43:48 Gershon Shafir: Now, as part of my own search for justice, which started in Israel under different circumstances, I became active, you could say, in the other political Israel, the other Israeli political party that was led by a woman, Shulamit Aloni's movement for civil rights. Sadly, it was a small party, but it was devoted to equal rights and the peaceful resolution of this very Palestinian conflict through territorial partition. And, in fact, I twice ran on its ticket to the Knesset. In 1982, I negotiated on behalf of the Peace Now Movement with the Israeli police, the terms of a demonstration for protesting the massacre of unarmed Palestinian refugees in the Sabra and Shatila camps in Beirut. With the, over the Allies, by the Lebanese Phalangists, or allies of the Israeli military, and demanded the appointment of a Commission of Inquiry to examine Israel's culpability. With 400,000 participants, this was the largest demonstrations in Israel's history, and my parents were also in that crowd. It also was, in my view, one of Israel's proudest moments of affirming its universal morality. It's already mentioned that in 2008, at UCSD, I founded the campus's Human Rights minor, as part of Eleanor Roosevelt College, and served

as its Director for six years. And it's a good moment to remember that the Universal Declaration of Rights was adopted following the atrocities of the Holocaust, and American-Jewish groups played a major lobbying role at the vacillating American administration, and therefore it always pains me when human rights are described as a partisan undertaking.

45:47 Gershon Shafir: So these responses, to punish the guilty and preserve the memory of the crimes and of the victims, were complemented by two more. One was emigration, in my case - again like in Tal's family - to Israel, and the creation of a new life and family - namely me. There were in short four responses; memory was just one of a range of complex responses. Another was the search for justice, and all of them have to be understood as complementing each other. Now I would like to turn to a fifth response, the importance of which became clear to me only gradually, but with greater urgency as I was becoming an adult. And now I want to talk about forgetting. When we urge our students to remember, we always assume that the memories we shared with them are bound up with a set of expectations on how they should live their lives. In that sense, you could say that memories always have a future in mind, but memory is only ever as virtuous as its users are, and an obsession with memory can blind us to abuses of memory, and to the potential uses of forgetting. One of my earliest warnings came when I got a phone call from a journalist after 9/11, and he wanted me to tell him just what did [Osama] bin Laden have in mind when he was talking about the events of 1924. I explained that this was the year in which the Muslim caliphate was officially abolished by the new Turkish Republic, the caliphate that bin Laden was intent on rebuilding.

47:29 Gershon Shafir: Memories, as it turns out, can also be weaponized. But I'm not here to talk about 9/11 or about bin Laden, I'd rather tell you about an article written by professor Yehuda Elkanah himself a survivor of Auschwitz, a renowned historian, and Professor of Science at Tel Aviv University - where I used to teach - and later the Chancellor of the Central European University in Budapest - which these days is being threatened with the closure by the Hungarian government. So Elkanah published in 1988 an article, and he called it *The Need to Forget*. Okay, here's a Holocaust survivor who calls on the need to forget, and he seemed to suggest, uh, in, in Phillip Roth's inspired phrase, to remember to forget. Okay here's what Elkanah wrote, lately I have become more and more convinced that the deepest political and social factor that motivates much of Israeli society, in its relationship with the Palestinians, is not personal frustration, but rather a profound angst, or anxiety, fed by a particular interpretation of the lessons of the Holocaust, and the readiness to believe that the whole world is against us and that we are the eternal victim. In this ancient belief, shared by so many today, I see the tragic and paradoxical victory of Hitler. I wish to assert that any philosophy of life nurtured solely or mostly by the Holocaust leads to disastrous consequences.

- 49:17 Gershon Shafir: Now in Israel during Holocaust Memorial Day, which has happened a few days ago, the central theme that is convened, conveyed repeatedly by talks by the Prime Minister, by the President, the Chief of the Military Staff, many times in Yad Vashem, is that all Jews are threatened by Nazi-style genocidal hostility. In fact, placing Israelis permanently in 1938 in anticipation of the coming of the power of the Nazis in 1939. Probably the best-known expression of this mentality belongs to Prime Minister Menachem Begin who was, more than anybody else, shaped and contributed to this mentality and in 1988, 1982 - during the conquest of Beirut by the Israeli Military and in search of Yasser Arafat - Prime Minister Begin wrote a letter to President Reagan in which he characterized himself as quote, a Prime Minister empowered to instruct a valiant army facing Berlin. Okay, not Beirut, but Berlin. Where, amongst innocent civilians, Hitler, not Yasser Arafat, but Hitler and his henchmen hide in a bunker deep beneath the surface. A survey conducted in 2009 by the Guttman Center asked Jewish Israelis about the guiding principles of their life and in response 98.1 percent - okay we don't get numbers like this in statistics - reported that remembering the Holocaust was one of those guiding principles. In fact, this was much more important for them than either feeling part of Israeli society or feeling Jewish.
- 51:04 Gershon Shafir: So for a country that does so much to memorialize or commemorate, it is, should be surprising that it's trying to suppress Palestinian remembering, or even thinking that this can be done by passing a law called the Nakba Law, which prohibits Palestinians from using state funds to, to commemorate their own expulsion in 1948. Israel cannot be both a world champion in commemoration and demanding forgetfulness on the parts of others. Now it might seem that I've started this talk with the importance of remembering, but now I'm making a full turn towards forgetting - that I'm making 180-degree turn. That however is not the case, especially today when Ken Livingstone, the former mayor of London, can say that before going mad and killing the Jews, Hitler was a Zionist, over when Sean Spicer can speak of Holocaust Centers and in general reveal a deep ignorance of the Holocaust under0-gearred with a strong dose of antisemitism. Memory is as important as ever, but remembering and forgetting are both part of the same impulse for memorialization. Maybe my desire for a greater remembering of the Holocaust outside of Israel, and the greater forgetting of it inside Israel is an unlikely wish, but still better than what we have now - an endless and obsessive memorialization in Israel and the callous forgetting outside. Thank you.
- 52:53 Joel Dimsdale: Can you hear me? Okay, uh, if I can just pick up on, on Gershon's last point. It's interesting about memory and forgetting, uh, this is the essence of growth. Uh, in bone growth we have osteoblasts and osteoclasts, and the only way, the only way that bones grow is that they build on a matrix of destroying some of the old bone and building on it. And so, that growth really involves an interesting synergy and mixture of memory and forgetting growth and describe and

destruction. But I'm wondering, um, I'm sure there, there are probably many questions, uh, from the audience. And if people have a question, if you could raise your hand and I think we're going to circulate mics.

54:05 Speaker 2: I have a loud voice.

54:07 Joel Dimsdale: But for recording purposes, we'd like, we'd like that loud voice to be recorded.

54:11 Judi Gottschalk: For posterity.

54:14 Joel Dimsdale: Speaking of memory.

54:16 Speaker 2: Hi, is this working? Okay is it working okay? I just wanted to know the title of the book that you had up there showing the Warsaw, uh, Ghetto. It was in Hebrew and unfortunately I don't read, or write, or speak Hebrew.

54:33 Tal Golan: It's called *Sitting on a Razor*. Sitting on a Razor, which is a Polish saying for somebody who has to watch very carefully what he does.

54:49 Joel Dimsdale: Are there, are there questions? So, I was struck by, by the -

54:56 Judi Gottschalk: She has a question.

54:58 Joel Dimsdale: I'm sorry. Oh, yes?

55:00 Speaker 3: I just have a comment in terms of how to make something tangible. I had experience with my tai chi teacher, 84, who had come to New York. His mother had had polio. I didn't know any of this until talking one day. His father had gotten out a few years earlier, and he wanted some letters translated, um, that, between his grandparents - who never got out. He had witnessed Kristallnacht. He never talked about it, was not invite, you know, really involved in Judaism - particularly now - that I knew of. And his son - in his 50s - didn't seem so interested. But what happened is, through a contact on his home in Berlin, there were these Stolpersteines - the memorial stones in Berlin. What do you do to involve people ongoing? And through, you know, a colleague this community organization put five Stolpersteines on that where just dedicated a couple weeks to go in front of the house, with the stone maker, and the children that go to a middle school next to the house where he grew up. And there's a gal- a framing shop there witnessed this. And he could not attend, but they, you know, videotaped this and the kids were amazed to know. Walter. Hi, you're still alive. They were so interested. So it's kind of a full-circle story. The names of his grandparents, and his aunt, and uncle he had also grown up with - they just disappeared. He knew they perished in Auschwitz. He knew a little bit about it through his mother, who would preserve the documents. I wanted the documents to go to the Holocaust Museum, um, but this was in some ways much more real because every day with these nine

and ten-year-olds go to school - a little older than when Walter and his mother escaped that night via train having seen and, you know, got to the States. I mean, it's just something that kind of carries on and the kind of students that were in these classes. You know, there were some teachers watching with a couple of us that watched this, uh, after the fact and there were, you know, multi-ethnic students from different places, a living crossroads that it is. But, I think, what do you do for somebody? And he had never, he said, talked about it for many years. And after his mother perished, his father, so I'm just trying to talk about concrete things that you can do, in a way that actually means something to the people that are around them. And it's just a suggestion that. Do you have any other tangible kinds of things like this that you can pass on to people?

57:19 Joel Dimsdale: Okay, do you want to respond to that?

57:21 Judi Gottschalk: Well, yes. I mean I, I believe in memorial. So it sounds like you're talking about a memorial to a certain extent. But I believe that memorials need education. You know, that it's okay to put up a memorial and whatever but if there's not education with it, to me personally, that's meaningless. I'm working personally on the butterfly project which is really to commemorate the 1.5 million children that were, you know, murdered in the Holocaust, but attached to it - you know, they're installations of these butterflies - but attached to it is education, uh, in the classroom. You know, it's, it's hard, I mean, the United States Holocaust Museum is doing a good job with education; Facing History [and Ourselves], ADL [Anti-Defamation League], there's some amazing programs. They just need to be more widespread.

58:12 Speaker 4: Um, this is Judi Gottschalk, etc. Um, I gather you're involved in the anti-bullying problem, project, right?

58:23 Judi Gottschalk: Yes.

58:24 Speaker 4: And I'm an in-between person; I don't know quite where I fit. I was three years old when World War II started and my parents, you know, grabbed the family and left Belgium and via, via France, Italy - no France, Spain, got to Morocco, spent a year there, eventually got to the United States. So I have a mix, kind of. I don't remember. I remember nothing. I remember the playground, but I know that I - that it's very, very much part of my life. I mean I was just thrown out of my home, you know, and thrown into - anyway, what I wanted to get to is, I, the way I have dealt with this. Once I was able to take in the horror of it all, um, was that I started doing research. I wrote a book about violence prevention, and, both in researching it and in being on the lecture circuit, I was just so struck by how many of the people who had also written books about violence prevention and related topics like bullying - I have a chapter in my book about anti-bullying programs - how so many of us come from a Holocaust background. And I just think, also on you mentioned the, uh, well several of you have mentioned the the

fact that Jews have been so heavily involved in justice programs, whether it's Civil Rights in the United States or, or, in South Africa and you know, etc. In so many different aspects and I'm just just wondering, how you, how much of the factor you feel this was in your, you know, in your bully anti-bullyism program, and so forth. Or anyone else that wants to talk about it.

1:00:18 Joel Dimsdale: Tal or Gershon?

1:00:31 Judi Gottschalk: You've got to talk into the mic because they're recording it.

1:00:38 Gershon Shafir: Yeah I think this is a very important and useful question. I think that overall the - of the sets of responses in regard of survivors and their children to the Holocaust - you can distinguish two main ones. One is that this should never happen to, to us again. Another one, this should never happen to anyone else ever again. Okay, and this is, you know, this is also a classic distinction between Jewish culture going back much further, and, but there is a sufficiently sizable percentage of survivors and their children who indeed - and you know I belong to some second-generation organizations - I met with some over the years. Many are involved in both educational, uh, educational projects and in the social justice issues. And many times they connect them together. Ironically in Israel, there was one time, right after the Eichmann Trial, when there was an attempt to universalize the experience of the Holocaust. There were several attempts to introduce it into the school curriculum in one way or another. I mentioned - you know, later on, I mentioned - I mentioned that this Shulamit Aloni, who was the head of the Civil Rights movement. She was the Minister of Education for a while in [Yitzhak] Rabin's government and she tried to introduce this into the Israeli curriculum, but she ended up being - she actually had to resign - because there was such a strong outcry against trying to present universal lessons of the, of the Holocaust in Israel. And the Holocaust template for Jewish life has, is, is now taken over fairly, um, I've been saying completely, but to a very large extent in Israel as well.

1:02:38 Tal Golan: It's hard to imagine here, from the US, the experience in Israel. That, the way the memory of the Holocaust is being nationalized, I mean, and and the tension between this to the private memories. Um, so for the long time, as I said, there was no really public space for private stories to reverberate. That change in the last generation or so as people, you know, grew older and felt that they need to tell the stories. It manifested in a wave of private publications, memoirs like my father's, but there were some attempts to generate discussion about this, but nothing that could really deal with this great wall of silence, or inability really to find words or a way to do it. I'm not sure, um, but, but as long as survivors live there among the Israelis there was some commitment to some kind of a civil discussion about this and respect. There still is, but it started to be a source of conflict, the memory of the Holocaust. Now it has been used. Not just long ago, when they were trying to do as a joint memory, or, uh, um. So, uh, that's it just it's a comment. It's not, I have no lessons to bring here. I'm not thinking that I know anything better

than you, but uh, coming from Israel I wanted just to emphasize um this aspect of the Holocaust. That has been uh -

1:04:38 Joel Dimsdale: Okay quest, question? There.

1:04:40 Speaker 5: Uh, hi. So sorry, I'm not really good at names. So, I think you are Mrs.

1:04:45 Judi Gottschalk: Judi. I'm Judi.

1:04:47 Speaker 5: Mrs. Gottschalk so I noticed that you have a German, uh, last name and, um, I'm, I I'm really curious about if you still speak German or Jewish?

1:05:00 Judi Gottschalk: Okay, so, um, my last name belonged to my husband, and his family, I think, really was from Russia but because of the boundaries back then in the, you know, early um, 20th century, 1900s, I think it got all mixed up, um, because they weren't German. My maiden name is Aaronfried, which is also German, but my father was Polish. And he was from a very small town in Poland called Żarki. And I think he spoke German, but they were not German, and my, my father spoke Yiddish. My mother was also Hungarian; she knew no Yiddish. She, she was born in Hungary. She didn't know any German. She just knew Hungarian until she met my father and was in the camps, she learned German. So no, no German background that I know of in my family, or even in my husband's family.

1:06:03 Speaker 5: Oh, so do you still speak Jewish?

1:06:07 Judi Gottschalk: No, I don't speak any Jewish. I only speak English, unfortunately, and I'm pretty mad at my mother for not teaching me Hungarian. But that's another experience because my parents were so busy trying to be Americans and trying to learn English that they really made an effort. My brother was two years old when we came here when they came here, and he probably spoke a little German but he - we only spoke English. My mother only spoke Hungarian to her friends on the telephone, and all I know is egan [yes] and nem tudom [I don't know]. That's all I know in Hungarian.

1:06:49 Joel Dimsdale: Question. Question back there.

1:06:53 Speaker 6: This question is directed towards the sociology professor. You mentioned about Israel like, um, trying to remember, but not forget the health of survivors. But there's this, uh, comment that you mentioned about like hiding them in the shadows. Uh, one time, like, uh, like you you try to, um, uh, the Israeli government try to memorialize - or try to - you know, uh, present the Holocaust information to the public but then they're not properly shown, and some of them are hid are hidden in the shadows. Like, um -

1:07:32 Tal Golan: I said it but that's okay.

1:07:34 Speaker 6: Oh, I'm sorry. I don't know. Um yeah, like some of them feel ashamed, you know, to be part of this historical event. And I just want to ask, like, uh, why do they feel ashamed? I took a historical, a history class. Like, uh, when Israel was founded some of them - some of the survivors - were actually blamed, that they weren't strong enough. And, uh, and this was kind of like a dilemma that I kind of approached myself, like, that was very, you know, like and I took it and I have a testimonial class with uh Professor Hillman. And then they shouldn't be held as heroes, but then they should be treated as differently, like, like normal people but then, you know, there's like different sorts of dilemmas that or maybe a comment?

1:08:21 Gershon Shafir: Okay, well, thank you for your question. I think the starting point here is that historical events don't naturally are transformed into memory; they are constructed and the multiple, and sometimes conflicting constructions of collective memory - which themselves are not necessarily factual, or complete, uh, let alone stable. Okay, and in Israeli case, there were four such constructions. The first one was what I would call a Zionist-proof text. Okay, meaning that the destruction of European Jewry is an illustration, is a proof. It's the ultimate proof of the fact that Zionism was necessary and right. Okay, and that takes us back to this, uh, to the argument that, um, that made it very difficult, made it very difficult to view the survivors in Israel as anything but victims. Okay, notwithstanding the fact that there are thousands of Holocaust survivors who arrived in Israel and became - who were young - and became soldiers in the 1948 war. But when they died there was nobody to write about them, whereas, versus those who were born there, and who had family, and whose, whose comrades were able to again memorialize them. So they became invisible within Israeli history, as well. A second construct was that the Holocaust, how shall I call it, was a, a wasting asset, especially as Germany became, at the beginning of the Cold War, Germany became, began to be rehabilitated and pulled into the Western orbit. And there was a fear, there was an anticipation that Germans will not take responsibility for their own, uh, actions during World War II, and in fact that they will keep all their, all the loot and proper Jewish property that they managed to expropriate. So there was a desire on the Israeli in part to, to have the Germans own up as much as they could make them, and also pay, pay, um, compensation to victims and to the state of Israel. In fact, in the very first speech given by German Konrad Adenauer, who was the German Chancellor, he didn't say that we have done this, or we have done that. He said Jews were killed in the name of the German people. Okay, that has changed considerably. So, that's the second approach.

1:11:16 Gershon Shafir: The third one that I mentioned is that, um, the universal one. In other words, the Holocaust is a template for safeguarding human rights. That's the one I, I think I belong to. I mean, I don't know, I belong to - I think this lady Judi and many others who work on this. But over the years in Israel the fourth, the fourth approach - namely the Holocaust is a template for Jewish life - in which a there is a sharp divide between Jews and others has been maintained and it's being

sharpened all the time to great, you know, I think to, to, to my consternation. But also to a great concern of people such as Yehuda Elkanah, whom I mentioned, but also many many others. And in that sense, a measure of forgetting, I believe, it could be, could be healthy. When the memory is being, become so one-sided and the other, other potential interpretations of being ignored and abandoned, I think it's important to recreate this balance between making sure it doesn't happen to us and making sure it happens to no one.

1:12:47 Joel Dimsdale: Judy did you? Judy had one -

1:12:49 Judi Gottschalk: I totally forgot what I was going to say. I'm sorry.

1:12:54 Tal Golan: If anybody wants to talk later I will be happy to, I mean. But, but to answer you after, this was a very learned question, answer. But I want to, people who are, Holocaust people function in Israel as an example and a lesson to learn that it will not happen again. It helped to serve an image, a counter-image, of the Israelis who grew up there, who are fighters, who are tough people, who do not break down, who can take anything. Uh, and it shaped - in that sense - a lot of Israeli society for many many years. This polarity is this, putting these people as the others, and defining the character of the Israeli in, in relation to this. So it served as a central cultural icon. It also fell, I must - and I have to be careful here - but it fell on fertile ground. Israel considered themselves victim long before the Holocaust, and there is a long story that the souls fit in into the Zionist story, into Israeli stories, about the historical story that is unfolding and yeah.

1:14:12 Joel Dimsdale: This is a session on, to certain extent, on memory and forgetting and Judi has remembered now.

1:14:19 Judi Gottschalk: Sorry. Thank you, Tal. I just want, because of the the - and I'm not as learned or as studied as these two, so respect them - but I can only speak from my experience here in San Diego, with my parents and their friends as survivors. And I think it was a very different kind of experience. I think coming to this country, you know, being a real minority, um, and sort of you know scratching your way to the top, basically, um, in many ways. And, uh, I'm not sure how that was different but I think there's probably more of an - except maybe there was more of an acceptance in Israel uh for survivors at that time, in the 45 - whereas... Do you think that's true or not? No, okay. So contrary. Okay, so here, um, I know from my own family's experience they were very accepted. It was a hard road for them but many of them did not speak, but many of them now - and of course, many have died recently - are very proud and have been very proud of their experiences. So maybe a little different.

1:15:31 Susanne Hillman: Okay on that note I would like to thank our moderator Joel Dimsdale, Judi, Gershon, and Tal.